

$\frac{A_{I2}}{208}$

Giorgio Resta

Trial By Media As a Legal Problem

A Comparative Analysis



Copyright © MMVIII
ARACNE editrice S.r.l.

www.aracneeditrice.it
info@aracneeditrice.it

via Raffaele Garofalo, 133 A/B
00173 Roma
(06) 93781065

ISBN 978-88-548-1914-6

*No part of this book may be reproduced in any form,
by print, photoprint, microfilm, microfiche, or any other means,
without written permission from the publisher.*

1st edition: July 2008

*To my beloved sister
Federica*

*«Without a free press there can be no free society.
Freedom of the press, however, is not an end
in itself but a means to the end of a free society»*

Felix Frankfurter

in *Pennekamp v. Florida* 328 U.S. 331 (1946)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I

Trying Cases in the Media: A Comparative Overview

1. Trial by Media: As American as the Apple Pie?	15
2. Justice and the «Reality» of the Mass-Media	19
3. A Comparative Approach	22
4. The Regulation of Speech Related to Court Proceedings: Three Models	24
4.1. Protecting <i>Speech</i>	25
4.2. Protecting <i>Justice</i>	26
5. Refining the Framework: the Dynamic Dimension of the Law	28
5.1. Beyond Common-Law Jurisdictions.....	31
5.2 Protecting <i>Personality</i>	32

CHAPTER II

Free Press v. Fair Trial: The American Way

1. Free Press v. Fair Trial: An Outline	37
2. Contempt of Court as a Deterrent Device: Origins and Evolution	40
2.1. The <i>Peck</i> Case and the Federal Contempt Statute	43

2.2. <i>Toledo Newspaper Co. v. United States</i>	49
3. The Supreme Court and the Disappearance of Contempt by Publication	51
3.1. Hugo Black, Felix Frankfurter and the <i>Bridges</i> Case	54
3.2. <i>Pennekamp v. Florida</i>	57
3.3. <i>Craig v. Harney</i>	60
3.4. The Problem of Trial by Jury	62
4. Post-Publication Sanctions and Private-Law Remedies	65
4.1. Disclosure of Truthful Information and the Protection of the Anonymity Interest	66
4.2. Suspect-Reporting and Defamation	71
5. The “Neutralizing Measures” Used to Control Prejudicial Publicity	73
6. The Problem of Pre-Publication Bans and the <i>Nebraska Press</i> Decision	75

CHAPTER III

Free Press v. Personality: The European-Continental Approach

1. Civilian Equivalents of the <i>Sub Judice</i> Rule	81
2. Pre-Trial Secrecy.....	85
3. The Gap Between the Law in the Books and the Law in Action.....	90
4. Information Politics.....	93
4.1. The C.O.E. Recommendation (2003) ¹³ on the Provision of Information Through the Media in Relation to Criminal Proceedings	96
5. Private-Law Remedies	99
5.1. Disclosure of a Suspect’s Identity and the Anonymity Interest.....	101
5.2. Unfair Legal Reporting and the Presumption of Innocence.....	105

CHAPTER IV

In Search of a Middle Ground: The Strasbourg Jurisprudence

1. The Approach of the European Court of Human Rights: A Comparative Perspective.....	115
2. Press Campaigns and the Right to a Fair Trial.....	117
3. Public Statements of Guilt and the Presumption of Innocence	120
4. Speech Interfering with Trial Proceedings and Contempt of Court	123
5. Pre-Trial Secrecy and Freedom of Speech.....	127
6. The Free Press and the Disclosure of Suspects' Identities.....	130
7. Media Coverage of Court Proceedings and the Right to Respect of Private Life.....	132
Conclusions.....	137
Bibliography	141

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book has been conceived over the past two years and is based on some work done in earlier articles. It relies, in particular, on the following essays of mine: «Trying Cases in the Media: A Comparative Overview», in *Law & Contemporary Problems* (forthcoming, Autumn 2008); «Guilty Until Proven Innocent? Trial by Media and European Law», in *LIBER AMICORUM FÜR GERT BRÜGGEMEIER* (Aurelia Colombi Ciacchi ed., forthcoming 2008); and «I nuovi oracoli del diritto: processi *by media* e laicità della giustizia» in *LA LAICITÀ DEL DIRITTO* (Angelo Barba and Michela Manetti, eds., forthcoming 2008).

The book has benefited from the considered advice of several colleagues and friends. Among those I would like to thank are Guido Alpa, Francesca Bignami, Giovanni Conso, Ian Cram, Andrea Fusaro, Luca Marafioti, Roberto Pardolesi, Karl-Nikolaus Peifer, Gavin Philipson, and Vincenzo Zeno-Zencovich. I owe special gratitude to Joshua Haber, Joan Magat, Marianne Ojo, and Aurelia Colombi Ciacchi for their invaluable assistance in editing the articles that served as a foundation of the book. Donatella Solda, Noah Vardi, and Elena Christine Zaccaria also provided excellent assistance. The usual disclaimer applies.

Financial support for the publication has been provided by the University of Bari (Department of Private Law).